BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 10631462 8

MUNICIPAL AND PLANNING LAW

S.M. Makuch

Volume 1

1982 - 1983

with the assistance of

Gary Yee

Faculty of Law

University of Toronto

LAW LIBRARY

OCT 1 1982

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FACULTY OF LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

MUNICIPAL AND PLANNING LAW

S.M. Makuch

Volume 1

1982 - 1983

with the assistance of

Gary Yee

Faculty of Law

University of Toronto

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/municipalplannin01maku_5

MUNICIPAL AND PLANNING LAW

Table of Contents

CHAPTER I

Introduction 1

Jarvis, Acting for a Developer 2

Robarts, Report of the Royal Commission on Metropolitan Toronto 6

Dupre, Intergovernmental Finance in Ontario: A Provincial-Local Perspective 11

Plunkett, The Financial Structure and the Decision-Making Process of Canadian Municipal Government 16

Notes and Questions 21

CHAPTER II

THE ORGANIZATION OF MUNICIPALITIES

Introduction 22

A. Approaches to Municipal Organization 23

Plunkett, Urban Canada and Its Government 23

Note 29

1. Municipal Council 30

Royal Commission on Metropolitan Toronto UPDATE 30

Note 30

2. The Executive 31

(i) The Mayor 31

Jaffary & Makuch, Local Decision-Making and Administration 31

(ii) Reforming the Executive 32

Jaffary and Makuch, Local Decision-Making and Administration 32

3.	The Board of Control - Executive Committee	34
	Plunkett, Urban Canada and Its Government	34
	Note	36
	Rowat, The Canadian Municipal System	36
	Jaffary & Makuch, Local Decision-Making and Administration	38
4.	The Manager Plan	
	Notes and Questions	40
	Rowat, The Canadian Municipal System	41
5.	Council-City Commissioner System	45
	Plunkett, Urban Canada and Its Government	45
6.	Standing Committees	46
	Jaffary and Makuch, Local Decision-Making	46
7.	Approaches to Reform	47
	(i) The Basic Assumption - Policy v. Administration	47
	Jaffary and Makuch, Local Decision-Making and Administration	47
	Hickey, Decision-Making Processes in Ontario's Local Governments	51
	(ii) The Winnipeg Experience	57
	Proposal for Urban Reorganization in the Greater Winnipeg Area	57
	Note	60
	Cook & Feldman, Approaches to Local Government Reform in Canada: The Case of Winnipeg	61
	Jacobs, The Death and Life of Great American Cities	62
	(iii) A New Suggestion for Toronto	64
	City of Toronto Neighbourhood Services Work Group, Report	64

B. The Reorganization of Municipalities 68

1. The Need for Reform 68

Advisory Committee on Intergovernmental Relations, In Search of Balance: Canada's Intergovernmental Experience 68

Advisory Committee on Intergovernmental Relations, Alternative Approaches to Governmental Reorganization in Metropolitan Areas 70

2. Distribution of Responsibilities 75

a) The Metropolitan Toronto Example 75

Note 75

b) Regional Government 76

The Ontario Committee on Taxation, Report: Volume II - The Local Revenue System 76

Note 83

3. The Problems With Reorganization 83

(i) Boundaries 83

Note 83

Robarts, Report of the Royal Commission on Metropolitan Toronto 84

(ii) Special Purpose Bodies 85

Note 85

Bureau of Municipal Research, "The 101 Governments of Metro Toronto" 85

Note 94

Re McAuliffe and Metro Toronto Bd. of Commissioners of Police 94

Note 95

Jaffary and Makuch, Local Decision-Making and Administration 95

(iii) Representation 96

Jaffary and Makuch, Local Decision-Making and Administration 96

(iv) Intra Regional Conflict 102

Simpson, City Loses Important Votes At First Meeting of Metro Council 102

Globe & Mail, City Decides on Legal Fight over Spadina 102

Globe & Mail, York Joins City in Opposing Spadina Paving 103

Weinstein, "The Effect of the Federal Reapportionment Decisions on Municipal Government" 104

(v) An Alternative: The Winnipeg Experience 105

Proposals for Urban Reorganization in the Greater Winnipeg Area 105

Globe & Mail, Assessing the Plan to Reform Winnipeg's Government 109

CHAPTER III

LOCAL GOVERNMENT FINANCING

Introduction 116

A. Introduction 117

1. Municipal Finance Generally 117

Plunkett, The Financial Structure and the Decision-Making Process of Canadian Municipal Government 117

Local Government Finance in Ontario (Ministries of Treasury and Economics & Intergovernmental affairs) 121

2. The Property Tax 129

The Ontario Committee on Taxation, Report: Volume II - The Local Revenue System 129

Plunkett, The Financial Structure and the Decision-Making Process of Canadian Municipal Government 131

B. Restraints on Municipal Finance 133

1. The Political Process 133

Plunkett, The Financial Structure and The Decision-Making Process of Canadian Municipal Government 133

Statement by Paul V. Godfrey, President Canadian Federation of Mayors and Municipalities 137

Note 140

2. Legal Restraints 141

Note 141

Re Corporation of the Township of Nepean 141

Jaffary and Makuch, Local Decision-Making and Administration 147

City of Toronto v. Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto 153

Re Township of Westminster and City of London 156

Re Victoria Harbour Sewage Service 159

Lewis v. Town of Prescott 164

Note 165

C. Property Tax Assessment 166

1. Who is Liable for Property Taxation 166

Note 166

2. What is Assessable Property 166

Note 166

Northern Broadcasting Co. Ltd. v. Improvement District of Mountjoy 167

Note 170

3. Exemptions From Taxation 171

Note 171

(i) Crown Land 171

Re Delta Parking Systems Ltd. and Township of Toronto 171

(ii)	Indian Lands	174
	Note	174
(iii)	Places of Worship and Cemetaries	174
	Note	174
	Re Presbyterian Church Building Corp. and Assessment Comm. for Algoma	174
	Re Singh and City of Sudbury	178
	Note	183
(iv)	Public Education Institutions, Philanthropic or Religious Seminaries and Educational Seminaries	184
	Note	184
	Re McMaster University and City of Hamilton et al.	184
	Note	188
	Donald Piazezza Beauty Salon et al. v. Corporation of the Borough of North York	188
	Note	191
	Gurdjieff Foundation v. Regional Assessment Commissioner, Region No. 9 et al.	192
	Note	194
(v)	Public Hospitals, Highways, Municipal Property, Boy Scouts and Girl Guides and Industrial Farms	194
	Note	194
(vi)	Municipal Properties	195
	Note	195
	Toronto Transit Commission v. City of Toronto	195
	Note	197
(vii)	Charitable Institutions	198
	Note	198
	Re Ina Grafton Homes and Township of East York	198
	Assessment Commissioner of the Village of Stouffville v. Mennonite Home Association of York County	201
(viii)	Children's Aid Societies, Scientific or Literary Institutions and Battle Sites	206
	Note	206

(ix)	Machinery and Equipment Used for Manufacturing or Farming Purposes	206
	Note	206
	The City of London v. John Labatt Ltd.	206
	Note	209
(x)	The Interpretation of "Property Of"	209
	Note	209
	Re Royal Ontario Museum and Assessment Commissioner for Region No. 10 et al.	209
	Re Markham York Hospital et al and Town of Markham	214
(xi)	Exceptions to Certain Exemptions	215
	Note	215
(xii)	Municipal Exemptions	216
	Note	216
(xiii)	Bonuses	216
	Note	216
	Re Whitton and City of Ottawa	216
	Note	217
4.	Valuation of Property	218
(i)	Market Value	218
	Note	218
	Ward, Market Value Re-Assessment	218
	Montreal v. Sun Life Assurance Co. of Canada	225
	Assessment Commissioner of the York Assessment Office v. Office Speciality Ltd.	238
(ii)	Equity	241
	Note	241
	Joint Committee on Property Tax Reform Interim Report: The Present Property Tax System	241
	Re Empire Realty Co. Ltd. and Assessment Commissioner for Metro Toronto	243
	Note	253
	Foxhead Inn Ltd. v. Regional Assessment Commission	253
	Re York Condominium No. 26 551 The West Mall and Assessment Commissioner for the Borough of Etobicoke	254

	Devald et al. v. Regional Assessment Commissioner, Region No. 16 et al.	258
	Downtown Oshawa Property Owners' Association, Hovell Holdings Limited and Drew Estate v. Regional Assessment Commissioner, Region Number 13, The Corporation of the City of Ottawa	261
	Note	264
	Regional Assessment Commissioners Region No. 2 et al. v. Ontario Steel Products Co. Ltd.	264
	Note	267
(iii)	Special Provision for Farm Land	268
	Note	268
(iv)	Special Provisions for Reforested Lands, Wood Lands and Orchards	269
	Note	269
(v)	Special Provisions for Golf Courses	269
	Note	269
(vi)	Other Special Provisions	269
	Note	269
5.	Business Assessment	270
	Note	270
(i)	Liability for Business Assessment - Carrying on a Business	270
	Note	270
	Re Windsor-Essex County Real Estate Board and City of Windsor et al.	270
	Note	272
	Re Delta Parking Systems Ltd. and Township of Toronto	272
	Re Saga Canadian Management Services Ltd. and City of Ottawa et al.	275
	Note	284
	Re United Trust Co. et al. and City of Toronto et al.	285
	Re Plumbing Mart	288
(ii)	Rate of Business Assessment	291

6. Appeals 292

Note 292

Downtown Churchworkers Association of the Anglican Church of Canada and Dioceses of Toronto v. Regional Assessment Commissioner, Region No. 7 et al. 293

D. Local Improvements and Special Assessment 300

Note 300

E. Conclusion 301

Financing Development of Local Government in Ontario 301

Notes and Questions 302

Report of the Royal Commission on Metropolitan Toronto 303

CHAPTER IV

JUDICIAL REVIEW OF MUNICIPAL ACTIONS

Introduction 322

A. Constitutionality 323

McKay v. The Queen 323

R. v. Beattie 323

R. v. Top Banana Ltd. 324

Note 324

B. Delegation 326

(i) To Employees 326

Russell v. The Corporation of Toronto 326

R. v. Sandler 327

R. v. Campbell 330

(ii) To Council Committees 331

Simon v. Gastonguay et al. 331

(iii) To the Community

R. v. Sepanary 334

Re Davies and Village of Forest Hill 335

C. Express Authority 339

Morrison v. Kingston 339

Re Christie Taxi Ltd. and Doran 341

Note 343

Ottawa Electric Light Co. v. Corporation of Ottawa 343

Re Weir et al. and The Queen 344

Notes and Questions 347

Re Pride Cleaners and Dyers 348

Re Regional Municipality of Ottawa-Carleton and Voyageur Colonial Ltd. et al. 351

Questions 354

The Royal Commission on Metropolitan Toronto Recommendations 356

D. Discrimination 358

Re Bunce and Town of Cobourg 358

R. v. Donald B. Allen Ltd. 360

City of Ottawa v. Royal Trust Co. 362

City of Verdun v. Sun Oil Co. Ltd. 366

Atkinson v. Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto 370

E. Vagueness 372

City of Montreal v. Morgan 372

F. The Impact of Provincial Policy 375

Re Regional Municipality of Ottawa-Carleton and Township of Marlborough 375

R. v. Morin 378

A. G. for Ontario v. City of Mississauga 381

G. Unreasonableness 396

Kruse v. Johnson 396

H. Geographic Limitations 397

Note 397

R. v. Roy 398

Note 403

I. Bad Faith 404

Re Howard and City of Toronto 404

Kuchma v. Rural Municipality of Tache 407

J. Technical Requirements 409

Re Whitton and City of Ottawa 409